

To the members of the Scientific Jury,
established by Order № P33-903 of 11.03.2021 of the
Rector of Plovdiv University "Paisii Hilendarski" for
the defence of the dissertation of Emilia Yordanova
Angelova- Hovagimyan - part-time doctoral student at
the Department of Public Law of the Faculty of Law of
the University of Plovdiv

REVIEW

by Assoc. Prof. Dr. Nadezhda Hristova Hristova ,
Law Faculty of the University of National and World Economy

Subject: presented for defence dissertation work of part-time doctoral student Emilia Yordanova Angelova- Hovagimyan for obtaining the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" in the field of higher education 3. "Social, economic and legal sciences", professional field 3.6. "Law", scientific specialty "Administrative law and administrative process" named "Public Law Aspects of Patient Safety" with supervisor Assoc. Prof. Dr. Konstantin Vasilev Pehlivanov from the Faculty of Law of the University of Plovdiv "Paisii Hilendarski" .

Distinguished members of the Scientific Jury,

As a member of the Scientific Jury, established by Order № P33-90 3 of 11.03.2021 of the Rector of Plovdiv University "Paisii Hilendarski" for evaluation of the dissertation entitled "Public Law Aspects of Patient Safety" by Emilia Yordanova Angelova-Hovagimyan - part-time doctoral student at the Department of Public Law of the Faculty of Law of the University of Plovdiv, I present my review, prepared on the basis of Art.10, para.1 of the Law for the Development of the Academic Staff of the Republic of Bulgaria (further ZRASRB; SG, issue 38 of 2010, amended and supplemented), Art. 32, para. 1 of the Regulations for Application of the Law on the Development of the Academic Staff of the Republic of Bulgaria, adopted by Council of Ministers Decree № 202 of 10.09.2010 (further PPZRASRB; SG, issue 75 of 2010, amended and supplemented) and Art. . 38, para. 1 of the Regulations for the Promotion of the Academic Staff of Plovdiv University "Paisii Hilendarski" 2011 (further PRASPU, amended and supplemented – available at <http://procedures.uni-plovdiv.bg/docs/praspu2018.pdf>).

1. Brief biographical data about the doctoral student

Emilia Yordanova Angelova- Hovagimyan graduated from the Law Faculty of the University of Plovdiv in 2018. In the same year she graduated with a master's degree in Health Management from the Higher School of Agribusiness and Regional Development. For the period September 2007 - December 2010, she was assistant manager in "Harigrup" Ltd., Plovdiv, for the period January 2010 - April 2019 she was a manager in "Emily 1881" Ltd. Plovdiv, and since January 2019 and currently she is a legal consultant in "AIPDP - VITADENT", Plovdiv.

2. General description of the submitted materials

The set of materials on paper and electronic media presented by Emilia Yordanova Angelova- Hovagimyan complies with Art. 36 PRASPU. She has presented three published scientific papers on the topic of her dissertation. In connection with the satisfaction of the minimal national requirements under Art. 2b, para. 2 and 3 of ZRASRB and Art. 1a, para. 1 of PPZRASRB, my assessment of the number of points achieved by the dissertation on the indicators defined in the appendix to Art. 1a, para. 1 of PPZRASRB for the field of higher education 3. "Social, economic and legal sciences", professional field 3.6. "Right" is as follows: by group of indicators A - at a minimum of 50, performance 50; by group of indicators B and C - there are no mandatory minimum requirements; by group of indicators D - at a minimum of 30, performance 30; by group of indicators D and E - there are no mandatory minimum requirements. From the presented materials and my above-mentioned assessment for satisfaction of the minimum national requirements under ZRASRB and PPZRASRB it can be concluded that Emilia Yordanova Angelova-Hovagimyan meets the requirements of Art. 2b, para. 2 and 3 of ZRASRB, art. 1a, para. 1 of PPZRASRB and Art. 30, Art. 31, Art. 32, para. 2 and Art. 33, para. 1 of PRASPU, for admission to defence of her dissertation.

3. Relevance of the topic and expediency of the set goals and objectives

The dissertation presented by Emilia Yordanova Angelova-Hovagimyan is dedicated to important, for both theory and practice, issues - public law aspects of patient safety. The relevance of the topic is determined by the inevitability of each individual to manifest himself in the social - legal quality of "patient", which is why adequate and effective mechanisms for ensuring patient safety should be arranged at institutional level. Patient safety is in immanent connection with the legal concept of "patient", which is regulated in Art. 84, para. 1 of the Health Act /promulgated, SG, is. 70 from 10.08.2004/,

according to which "patient is any person who is or to whom has been rendered medical care", since it guaranteed safety, which emphasize the actuality of the topic. In this regard, the goals and objectives are appropriately and successfully formulated in the dissertation.

4. Knowledge of the dissertation

From the content of the dissertation it can be concluded that Emilia Yordanova Angelova-Hovagimyan knows very well the state of the issues she is considering. She used a large number of doctrinal and legal sources, and this is an indicator for very good awareness of the literature and a broad general culture.

5. Research methodology in the dissertation

In the submitted for review dissertation work "Public Law Aspects of Patient Safety" are used primarily general scientific methods of knowledge - law historical method, comparative law method, inductive and deductive method, which allowed her to achieve the goals and objectives of the dissertation study.

6. General characteristics and evaluation of the dissertation

In structural terms, PhD thesis consists of: an introduction (p. 5- 8) ; three chapters devoted respectively to : patient safety in the world - definitions and historical review (Chapter First , p. 8-101) , analysis of health system and patient safety in Bulgaria (Chapter Second, p. 102-201) and quality and culture as a factor for patient safety - the responsibility of doctor under Bulgarian law (Chapter Third , p. 202-300) ; conclusion (p. 300-304); list of used literature (p. 303-305) , containing 43 titles in Cyrillic and 17 titles in Latin ; list of electronic sources (pp. 305-309), containing a total of 208 electronic pages and links.

The presented research has the significance and the necessary qualities of a dissertation for awarding the educational and scientific degree "Doctor". In structural and meaningful terms, the presented dissertation is a very good indicator of creative activity and purposeful research abilities of the doctoral student. This is an in-depth and analytical work. In my opinion, this work is featured by scientific novelty, relevance and also with a practical orientation. I evaluate the exposition in the dissertation as purposeful, meaningful and useful for the legal doctrine and practice of the respective judicial and administrative bodies. It is accompanied by separate comparisons and distinctions, substantiation of conclusions and proposals *de lege ferenda*.

7. Contributions and significance of the dissertation work for science and practice

I evaluate the scientific and scientific-applied contribution of the dissertation as essential and useful for the legal doctrine and practice of the respective state bodies.

The following specific scientific and scientific-applied contributions in the dissertation can be highlighted as follows:

- 1) very good historical and legal analysis of patient safety (p. 8 - 14) ;
- 2) useful and reasoned author's definition of the term "patient safety" (p. 19) ;
- 3) useful author's analysis of the terms "patient" and "patient safety" with (p. 20) ;
- 4) contributive analysis of the status of the World Health Organization and the World Alliance for Patient Safety in relation to patient safety (p. 74 - 87) ;
- 5) useful author's analysis of the international and European normative sources in the field of patient safety (p. 95 - 102) ;
- 6) good analysis of national programs, strategies and plans for protecting the health of the nation, including the National Plan for Vaccination Against COVID-19 in the Republic of Bulgaria - the document was adopted by Decision № 896 of the Council of Ministers on 12.07.2020 (p. 105 - 117) ;
- 7) an original author`s proposal of measures for improvement of the health policy, which would guarantee at the same time to all citizens/patients quality and safe treatment (p. 117) ;
- 8) useful author's conclusions after an analysis of the current legislation, followed by the extremely useful author's proposal *de lege ferenda* for the adoption of a new law, named "Patient Safety Act" (p. 136) ;
- 7) an original author's proposal for taking measures to improve the health policy, which would guarantee at the same time to all citizens/patients quality and safe treatment (p. 117) ;
- 8) original author's proposals for improving the work of the Executive Agency "Medical Supervision", followed by specific proposals *de lege ferenda* for: change of the legal status of the executive director of the Agency; creation of a new directorate within the Agency - "Internal Control" with risk assessment functions, for performing control functions by inspectors, analysis of the achieved individual results and bonifications for employees who strictly and qualitatively perform their assigned tasks; establishment of territorial divisions of the Agency (p. 163)

9) a useful analysis of the legal status of the Health Ombudsman (p. 42) ;

10) extremely useful author's proposal *de lege ferenda* for introduction of mandatory continuing education of providers of medical care providers of dental care, and mandatory certification of all doctors every three years (p. 297) ;

4) The Conclusion chapter contains valuable for the legal theory and practice more general conclusions, as well as proposals for the improvement of the legal framework (pp. 238 - 241).

8. Evaluation of the publications on the dissertation

Emilia Yordanova Angelova-Hovagimyan applied these three publications on the subject of his dissertation work as follows: " Novelties in Administrative and Financial Requirements Concerning Electronic Statements and Invoices between Medical Institutions and National Health Insurance Fund" in : Collection " Scientific Readings " dedicated to the 140th anniversary of the Adoption of the Tarnovo Constitution , ed . Ciela Norma AD, 2019 , ISBN 978-954-28-3043-6 ; " Administrative Violations and Types of Administrative Penalties Imposed on the Providers of Medical and Dental Care - Contractual Partners of the NHIF“ in: Collection of Reports from a Scientific Conference Dedicated to the 50th Anniversary of the Entry into Force of the Law on Administrative Violations and Penalties, held on 16.12.2019, University Publishing House "St. Kliment Ohridski ”, Sofia 2020, ISBN 978-954-07-4975-4 ; " Patient Safety in a State of Emergency in Bulgaria", in: Proceedings of the Annual University Scientific Conference May 28-29, 2020 , Volume 8, Scientific Department "Social, Economic and Legal Sciences", Veliko Tarnovo, Publishing House of Vasil Levski National High School 2020, ISSN 1314-1937

The presented scientific reports examine current issues related to the topic of the dissertation. These publications aptly reflect the analyses and opinions of the author, further enshrined in certain parts of the dissertation.

9. Personal participation of the doctoral student

Personal merit of Emilia Angelova-Hovadimyan are the scientific and scientific-applied contributions of the dissertation and the presented scientific reports. The doctoral student correctly referred to doctrinal sources.

10. Opinion on the abstract

The abstract of the dissertation is presented in Bulgarian and English. It is developed at a good level and fully reflects the content of the dissertation and the results achieved.

11. Critical remarks and recommendations

Some remarks and recommendations may be addressed to the dissertation, mainly of an editorial nature.

11.1. When the doctoral student refers to the practice of the Supreme Administrative Court, it is desirable to indicate the relevant judicial act (for example on p. 137).

11.2. I recommend the indication of the full content of the court acts, which the doctoral student considers important in connection with the considered issues, to be made in a separate appendix to the dissertation, but not in the main text (for example on pages 183 – 184).

11.3 It would be appropriate the summary of the dissertation to include in the the bibliography with indication of the starting page.

These weaknesses, however, do not diminish the importance of the dissertation submitted for review. They only aim to help the author in case she decides to continue his creative efforts on this topic.

12. Personal impressions of the doctoral student

13. Recommendations for future use of dissertation contributions and results

Due to the up-to-date relevance of the issues researched, I recommend to Emilia Yordanova Angelova-Hovagimyan to publish the dissertation as a book. I believe that this book would be of interest to scientists, practitioners and students.

14. Conclusion

Finally, based on the above:

1. I declare that the dissertation work “Public Law Aspects of Patient Safety” contains scientific and scientific-applied results, which represent an original contribution to science and meet the requirements of Art. 6, para. 3 of ZRASRB, Art. 27, para. 2 of PPZRASRB and Art. 32, para. 1 and 2 of PRASPU. At the same time, this dissertation shows that Emilia Yordanova

Angelova-Hovagimyan has in-depth theoretical knowledge and professional skills in the scientific specialty "Administrative Law and Administrative Process" by demonstrating qualities and skills for independent research. Therefore, the doctoral student meets the requirements of Art. 6, para. 1 of ZRASRB, Art. 24-26 of PPZRASRB and Art. 29, 30, 31 and 32, para. 1 and 2 of PRASPU.

2. In connection with the above, on the grounds of Art. 10, para. 1 of ZRASRB, Art. 32, para. 1 of PPZRASRB and Art. 38, para. 1 of PRASPU, I give my positive assessment of the conducted research, presented by the above-reviewed dissertation, abstract, achieved results and contributions.

3. I propose to the esteemed scientific jury, formed by Order № P33-90 3 of 11.03.2021 of the Rector of the University of Plovdiv "Paisii Hilendarski", on the grounds of Art. 11, para. 4 of ZRASRB, Art. 34, para. 1 of PPZRASRB and Art. 29 of PRASPU, to award the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" to Emilia Yordanova Angelova-Hovagimyan in the field of higher education 3. "Social, Economic and Legal Sciences", professional field 3.6. "Law", doctoral program "Administrative Law and Administrative Process".

Sofia, 07.04 .2021

Reviewer:

(Assoc. Prof. Dr. Nadezhda Hristova)