

OPINION

From Assoc. Prof. Bogdan Dragnev Yordanov

For dissertation for award of educational and scientific degree "Doctor" in the field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, professional field 3.6 Law, doctoral program "Administrative Law and Administrative Process" entitled "Public Law Aspects of Patient Safety" with author Emilia Yordanova Angelova- Hovagimyan

Primary unit: Department of Public Law, Faculty of Law, University of Plovdiv

Scientific adviser: Assoc. Prof. Konstantin Vassilev Pehlivanov Ph.D.

Pursuant to Order № P33-903 of 11.03.2021 of the Rector of the University of Plovdiv I was appointed as a member of the scientific jury in the procedure for defence of a doctorate thesis named "Public Law Aspects of Patient Safety" for award of the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" in field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, professional field 3.6. Law, doctoral program "Administrative Law and Administrative Procedure". The dissertation thesis is prepared by Emilia Yordanova Angelova- Hovagimyan - part-time doctoral student at the Department of Public Law, with supervisor Assoc. Prof. Konstantin Pehlivanov Ph.D. As a member of this scientific jury, I was assigned to present an opinion on the dissertation.

The materials sent under the procedure meet the requirements of the law and the accompanying bylaws and this is a guarantee for the completeness and legality of the procedure. The doctoral student was enrolled after the amendments to the Law for the Promotion of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria (ZRASRB). As can be seen from the submitted publications to the dissertation, the author meets the minimum national requirements according to the Regulation for application of the Law.

General nature of the dissertation

I find that the structure, the distribution of chapters and paragraphs and the arrangement of the matter in them allows for a complete and objective presentation of the problem that is the subject of this paper.

Structurally, the dissertation consists of: introduction (pp. 5-8); three chapters dedicated to: patient safety in the world - definitions and historical review (Chapter One, pp. 8-101), the analysis of the health system and patient safety in Bulgaria (Chapter Two, pp. 102-201) and quality and culture as a factor for patient safety - the responsibility of the doctor according to Bulgarian law (Chapter Three, pp. 202-300); conclusion (pp. 300-304); list of used literature

(pp. 303-305), containing 43 titles in Cyrillic and 17 titles in Latin; list of electronic sources (pp. 305-309), containing a total of 208 electronic pages and links. The references are made correctly and show that the doctoral student's awareness in the scientific field in which she worked was sufficiently thorough and up-to-date.

Contributions and significance of the dissertation for science and practice

The dissertation offers a theoretical study on a very wide front, with a scientifically applied character. The richness of literary sources is also impressive, as well as the diverse case law used by the doctoral student in defending and substantiating her theses. Some of the important contributions to the dissertation are:

1. a very extensive historical overview of patient safety - from antiquity to the present day;
2. a detailed analysis of the patient safety of the health systems of twelve countries, and through the conclusions made suggestions were reached that would fill the gaps in our health system;
3. author's definition of "Patient Safety", which is quite well argued;
4. the author's analysis of the participants of the patient safety, the initiatives in the world plan for the safety of the patients, the comparative analysis of the international sources for protection of the rights of the patients are significant contribution;
5. author's analysis of the health system and patient safety in Bulgaria , which includes programs to improve the health of the nation in recent years, and the author's proposal that aim to improve the health of citizens / patients ;
6. author's analysis of the most frequent mistakes in the work of Executive Agency „Medical Supervision” in the last three years - 2018, 2019 and 2020 , the proposals for improving of its activity; followed by specific proposals de lege ferenda for: change of the legal status of the Executive Director of the Agency; creation of a new directorate within the Agency - "Internal Control" with risk assessment functions, performing control functions by inspectors, analysis of the achieved individual results and bonus for employees which strictly and qualitatively perform their assigned tasks; creation of territorial divisions of the Agency, creation of new structural regulations;
7. author`s own exploration survey on patient safety, which includes questions about the meanings and needs her as looking for answers to citizens' confidence in the supervisory authorities that regulate health;
8. a detailed study of the current legislation, ending with the de lege ferenda proposed "Patient Safety Act"
9. useful author`s proposals de lege ferenda for establishment of Patient Safety Agency, Register for reporting adverse medical events , full digitalization of all processes in healthcare , National Register and internal registers to each

hospital , continuing postgraduate training of a mandatory character (anonymous attestation of doctors), National Fund for the benefit of patients .

Evaluation of the scientific publications of the doctoral student

The dissertation submitted to for my opinion includes three publications of the author on the topic. I believe that the publications are related to the dissertation and reflect a significant part of the results achieved. I also believe that in terms of scientific value as a number of publications meet the generally accepted requirements. Personal merit of Emilia Angelova-Hovagimyan are the scientific and scientific-applied contributions of the dissertation and the presented scientific reports. The doctoral student correctly referred to doctrinal sources. The abstract reflects well enough the content of the dissertation and makes it possible to objectively assess the results achieved.

Recommendations for future use of dissertation contributions and results

This dissertation is extremely relevant. I recommend Emilia Angelova- Hovagimyan to publish her dissertation as a book, because it would be useful for different categories of readers.

Critical notes to the dissertation

In view of the essence of the dissertation I have no remarks, in view of the technical layout of the work it would be useful to structure the cited case law in a separate appendix, as well as to revise the list of cited literature - separately in Bulgarian and foreign languages, separately monographs and periodicals. In the list of cited literature there are publications with a source on the Internet, but the dissertation generally indicates these sources separately; some sources do not provide complete bibliographic data (items 47, 57, 58). The note does not diminish the value of the work and draws the attention of the author concerning future work and possible publication.

Conclusion:

The doctoral student Emilia Yordanova Angelova- Hovagimyan has successfully completed her doctoral studies. The research is based on a sufficiently thorough and up-to-date literature review. The essential parts of the dissertation are reflected in a sufficient number of publications in authoritative scientific forums. The dissertation contains an independent analysis and meaningful proposals for changes in the legal framework. All this gives me reason to find that the dissertation meets the requirements of the Law on the Promotion of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria and the Regulation for its implementation and I find that due to the quality of the dissertation thesis "Public Law Aspects of Patient Safety" Emilia Angelova Yordanova-Hovagimyan should be awarded the educational and scientific degree "doctor" in higher education field 3. Social, economic and legal studies,

professional field 3.6 Law, doctoral program "Administrative Law and Administrative Process".

.....

(Assoc. Prof. Bogdan Yordanov Ph.D.)

04/26/2021

Plovdiv