

A REVIEW

delivered by:

Tzveta Yordanova Zafirova, PhD - a professor at the University of Economics, Varna

based on the submitted materials
in regards to the competitive selection procedure of applicants
for the tenure-track academic job position
'Associate Professor'
at the University of Plovdiv "Paisii Hilendarski"

in the Field of Higher Education 3. *Social, Economic, and Legal Sciences*
Professional Field 3.7. *Administration and Management*
Scientific specialty *Economics and Management - Human Resources Management*

The competitive selection procedure for the "Associate Professor" job position is publicly announced both at the State Gazette, Issue 31, as of April 12, 2019, and at the website of the University of Plovdiv "Paisii Hilendarski" – to meet the needs of the Department of Management and Quantitative Methods in Economics at the Faculty of Economic and Social Sciences. In reference to this, it is the Chief Assistant Professor Mina Nikolaeva Angelova, PhD of the University of Plovdiv "Paisii Hilendarski", who applied as a candidate for this job position.

1. General Presentation of the Procedure and the Candidate

It is the Order № P33-3749 of July 11, 2019 of the Rector of the University of Plovdiv "Paisii Hilendarski" (UP), which designates me as a Full Member on duty for the Scientific Jury Panel to deliver professional assertion on employment for the academic job position "**Associate Professor**" at UP in the field of Higher Education 3. Social, Economic, and Legal Sciences; Professional Field 3.7. Administration and Management (Economics and Management - Human Resources Management), **announced by** the Faculty of Economic and Social Sciences (FESS) **to meet the needs of** the Department of Management and Quantitative Methods in Economics (MQME) of the FESS.

It has to be stated that for the announced competitive selection procedure, it is **only one candidate**, who has applied for this position:

**Chief Assistant Professor Mina Nikolaeva Angelova, PhD of the University of Plovdiv
"Paisii Hilendarski".**

The submitted set of materials of ch. ass. prof. M. Angelova, PhD is duly prepared as a paper-bound set, and it is in compliance to the *Rules of Development of the Academic Staff of the University of Plovdiv* (RDASUP). It includes the next documents:

- a request to the Rector for admission to the competition;
- a CV prepared toward requirements of the *European format*;
- a Master Degree diploma;
- a Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) Degree diploma;
- a list of scientific papers;
- a reference for compliance with the minimum national and additional faculty requirements;
- an annotation of materials, including self-assessment of contributions;
- a declaration of originality and authenticity of the enclosed documents;
- transcripts of protocols from the Department Council, Faculty Council, and Academic Council in connection with the competition;
- a State Gazette announcing the competition;
- a length of service certificate;
- documents for teaching practice;
- research documents;
- documents in accordance with additional requirements of the respective faculty;
- other documents.
- set of documents on paper from item 1 to item 15;
- set of documents in electronic media including item 1, item 2, from item 4 to item 14.

The applicant ch. ass. prof. M. Angelova, PhD submitted a total of 29 scientific papers deemed compatible for scientific consideration and assertion, as they do not fall at the scope of the PhD-thesis works and are not used in a competitive selection procedure to occupy the academic job position of the “Assistant” and “Chief Assistant Professor”.

They are structured as follows: 2 studies, 1 monograph, 1 book, 2 textbooks (first and second revised and supplemented edition) and 23 scientific papers. There is a contents overlap in publications №25 and №29, so it's taken for assertion only publication №25 (in English).

In the current assertion is not included the book because it's a PhD-related publication (publ. №4).

Based on the above mentioned, 27 publications are taken in consideration for review in this competitive procedure for the tenure-track academic job position 'Associate Professor'.

Furthermore, some of the publications are based upon the survey and the conceptual framework of the dissertation and, in this sense, some of the contributions can be treated as

contributions in the dissertation (for instance publications №5, №28, etc.). It should be noted that they are not a subject of the current review and are not included in its content.

Therefore, classification of the 27 scientific papers by the standards of compliance used in Bulgaria and abroad, is as it follows: 24 papers are popularized in Bulgaria (13 of which are in English language and 11 are in Bulgarian) and other 3 papers are published abroad (publications №6, №12 and №16).

2. A Brief Biographic Data of the Applicant

Ch. ass. prof. M. Angelova, PhD was born in 1986 r. She graduates a High-School of Mathematics “Akademic Kiril Popov” Plovdiv, and the Higher education – in Faculty of Economics of the University of Food Technologies. Dr. Angelova holds a Bachelor Degree in “Industrial Management” and a Master Degree in “Economics of Food Industry”.

During the period 2011-2014 she is studying in a full-time PhD programme at the Department of Industrial Business in the University of National and World Economy (UNWE), Sofia. She defends her dissertation and obtains the Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) Degree in the science specialty 05.02.18 Economics and Management (Motivation of Human Resources). – *Annex 4*.

From 2009 till 2017 she has valuable practical experience in positions, such as a Marketing Expert in “Triton I & I” JSC, Customer Relations Manager in “Bimex Engineering” JSC, and General Manager in “Agency Avrora” Ltd.

In 2011 she starts working as a part-time assistant professor at the Department of Industrial Business in the UNWE, Sofia. In 2015 she is a tenure-track assistant professor at the post of Chief Assistant at the Department of Management and Quantitative Methods in Economics of the FESS in UP. She has numerous awards and honors received for excellence during her Bachelor, Master and PhD Degrees.

Dr. Angelova has participated in a total of 5 projects as of them 3 are scientific projects and 2 are applied projects. She is a Project-Leader of 2 projects.

At present, the applicant teaches a total of 5 academic courses in the management field.

She participated in programme Erasmus+ Staff Mobility for Teaching in universities in Spain and Slovakia. She is a participant and organizer of different scientific events - conferences, round tables, public academic lectures, etc. She has a total of 41 scientific papers, published in Bulgarian and foreign international editions. She is a member of prestigious Bulgarian organizations as follows: *the Union of Economists in Bulgaria, the Union of Scientists - Plovdiv, the Association of Teachers of Economics and Management, and the Bulgarian Association for Management of People (Annex 2)*.

She is fluent in English and Russian.

3. General Characteristics of the Applicant's Activities

Estimation of the academic activities and preparation of the applicant

It is evident from the submitted Certificate of Work Experience that Dr. Angelova has a pedagogical internship 8 years and, in particular, 4 years at the tenure-track position of 'Chief Assistant' in the UP (*Annex 11*).

She has elaborated and presented with multimedia presentations the next academic courses: *Human Resources Management, Management by Motivation, Motivational Techniques and Practices; Economics of Enterprise; Evolution of Management*. The academic courses are provided by Chief Assistant Professor Mina Angelova, PhD, based on a genuine authorship approach set in the Syllabus of the courses.

The academic course *Economics of Enterprise* is presented in English for the needs of teaching foreign students according Erasmus programme.

Furthermore, she participated in 3 International projects and realized staff mobility for teaching in Spain (The University of Valladolid and the University of Granada) and in the University of Economics, Slovakia (*Annex 2*).

It should be noted, that the academic courses of the applicant are connected with the theme of the competitive selection procedure - Economics and Management.

The academic courses (lectures and seminars) undoubtedly have a practical implementation based on her expert experience.

Her auditorium teaching load for the academic 2018/2019 year is accounted at 585 hours of lectures and seminars (converted to academic exercises) (*Annex 12*). She has a teaching load that meets, and even exceeds, the approved annual mandatory teaching load at the UP.

According to this, I can make the conclusion that Mina Angelova was able to establish herself as a teacher and gain the experience required as a lecturer.

In addition, according the submitted set of materials in this competitive procedure, she is the author of a genuine textbook "Evolution of Management", which is duly composed, in a readable manner, and it provides a high-profile scientific and methodical level to the reader. It is revised and supplemented in the second edition, based on the author's efforts to improve the content.

The analysis of the quantitative and qualitative evaluation of the academic activities substantiates the assertion that Dr. Angelova's R&D activities fully correspond to the requirements of the tenure-track job position of 'Associate Professor'.

Evaluation of the scientific and applied science activities of the applicant

Of the submitted 29 scientific publication, there are 14 individual papers and 15 papers with co-authors as follows: 7 papers with 1 co-author, 3 publications with 2 co-authors, 5 papers with 3 co-authors. 19 papers are in English language (of which 8 are in *Scopus* and *Web of Science*) and 10 are in Bulgarian language (*Annex 7*).

The publications include 1 monograph, 2 academic studies, 2 textbooks, 1 book based on the dissertation, and 23 articles and reports.

The scientific results are presented in total of 12 International scientific conferences in Bulgaria.

The submitted scientific papers in the competitive selection procedure for the tenure-track academic job position of ‘Associate Professor’ are in the field of the science specialty “Economics and Management”. They are a result of deep scientific surveys as well as the implementation of new investigation tools.

Affidavit of support of the quality of the mentioned above papers and publications, is the fact that 8 of them (1 study and 7 papers) are subject to references and indexes in world-renowned scientific information databases (*Scopus* and *Web of Science*), based on their importance and scientific contributions.

The research activity of Mina Angelova includes the participation in total of 5 scientific and applied-scientific projects including 1 International, 2 National, 1 Faculty и 1 financed by the scientific fund of the UP (*Annex 13*). She is a Project-Leader of 2 projects. These facts serve as an evidence of her research and application skills. The results of these projects are published in prestigious scientific editions.

Contributions (scientific, applied-scientific, applied)and citations

The applicant in this competitive procedure has submitted enough scientific papers that are relevant and are devoted to important problems of the theory and, in practical manner, in the field of Economics and Management.

In the submitted individual monograph „Social Entrepreneurs and Social Entrepreneurship: the Case of Bulgaria”, the author develops the theory of the social entrepreneurship through investigation of some managerial aspects of the social enterprises. The paper is duly composed, in a readable manner, and it provides a high-profile scientific and methodical level to the reader.

The aims of the monograph are connected with the role of the social entrepreneurship as an essential factor for the development of the creativity and innovativeness of the Bulgarian entrepreneurs, and hence the competitiveness of the national economy. The research examines the

existing state of the opportunities and motivation for Social Entrepreneurship in Bulgaria, the reasons and the factors that determine them, its consequences, and the utilization of the opportunities with a view to increasing the share of Social Enterprises (SEs) and the motivation of employees and owners. Its made an investigation of the working environment of the Bulgarian social enterprises and are formulated the specific conditions they work in.

Furthermore, besides the research and systematization of national, strategic and program documents according the national policies for the role of the social entrepreneurship, there are emphasized the opportunities for funding social enterprises in Bulgaria.

The results of these investigations are of particular interest in practical application in the field. They will support the management of the social enterprises.

It's presented in the monograph the results from an investigation held in the period November 2017 –March 2018 with managers and owners of social enterprises as experts practitioners in different fields of the social entrepreneurship - the specific factors of the environment, the motivation for participation, the adjustable to the market conditions, etc. Moreover, this serves as an opportunity to create a profile of the social entrepreneur.

The set of research tasks is fulfilled. It should be also noted that the author is well-prepared as in the investigated field, as in the application of the research tools.

In the monograph are applied purposeful recommendations for improvement the environment of the social enterprises as well as toward opportunities for mobilization of the outside and inside resources. It's remarked the need for more active promotion of the social entrepreneurship into the current business practice. The above mentioned proves the applied scientific importance of the monograph delivered by ch. ass. prof. Mina Angelova, PhD.

In general, Dr. Angelova's papers and publications are dedicated to current and insufficiently researched scientific field.

It can be summarized different contributions, some of which develop the existing knowledge, while others are connected with application of the existing theory in specific practical solutions in different economic fields – machine-building, wine production, meat production, chemical industry, etc.

I accept the division of scientific and applied science contributions, according to the mode of submission by the candidate as important and real. Some of them could be summarized and reformulated.

I would like to highlight some of the main results and contributions in science and in practical manner, as follows:

Scientific contributions:

- It's enriched the knowledge of the social entrepreneurship based upon the existing theory and the Bulgarian experience. Moreover, it's been formulated new statements of opinion and specific systematization in different fields of it.

- It's been developed and enriched the science knowledge about the entrepreneurial culture (EC) through the realization of surveys of different topic groups. Based on this, the EC has been emphasized as a factor for increasing the competitiveness of the Bulgarian economy.

- Furthermore, it's made a comprehensive investigation during the period 2007-2017 of important aspects connected with the impact of the political environment and political culture over the innovation process in Bulgaria. Based on this, it's been highlighted the important problems and tendencies and the connection among them according the sustainable development of the entrepreneurship.

- It has been investigated the role of digital entrepreneurship as an essential factor to increase the creativity and innovativeness for sustainable development of Bulgarian bio based economy. Moreover, it's marked the importance of the digital marketing in this process.

Applied science contributions:

- It's made a deep approach over the innovative practices in some industries and regions in Bulgaria. There is an analyzes of important characteristics and weaknesses. It's been marked the opportunities for their implementation.

- A modern methodological approach is proposed and tested to evaluate the relations of elements in the process approach in enterprise management and their specific characteristics for achieving sustainable development. As a result, the theory and practice in the field have been enriched.

- It's been scientifically substantiated and proven the connection between the various factors in the management of business processes in different types of enterprises in the meat processing industry through empirical study of a representative sample in the region. This survey serves as an evidence to measure the influence and the level of impact on their innovativeness, effectiveness and competitiveness.

- Modern HRM models and methods are proposed, incl. more capacity building tools through informal training and verification of knowledge of specialists from wine industry.

Applied contributions:

- It's been proposed different methods and models for financing the entrepreneurship, incl. social enterprises, that has a great practical value for the enterprises positioned in the region.

- Moreover, recommendations and propositions in practical aspect have been analyzed, systematized and summarized in the next fields: machine-building, wine industry, meat industry, etc.

In summary, the scientific contributions of the applicant may be summarized in the following categories:

- **enriching and development of the existing knowledge** in the field of economics and management;

- **application of the scientific contributions in the practice.**

In the submitted set of documents in this competitive selection procedure, the candidate has applied a document - *A reference for compliance with the minimum national and additional faculty requirements (Annex 6)*. It includes a reference of compliance with the national requirements of the the *Act for the Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria (ADASRB)* in the Field of Higher Education 3. Social, Economic, and Legal Sciences.

In Group D are included a total of 13 citations (2 of them are in monographs, 5 of them are in papers, and 6 are in reports) of the applicant's publications made by famous Bulgarian scientists.

Furthermore, 2 of them are in world-renowned scientific information databases.

It should also be mentioned, that Dr. Angelova's papers and publications are dedicated to current and insufficiently researched scientific fields. In general, they are important for the Bulgarian theory and practice, as a whole.

I would like to highlight some of the main results and contributions of the applicant in this competitive selection procedure:

- The candidate has submitted a sufficient number of scientific papers, published after the materials employed for the defence of the PhD Degree, and after meeting the occupation criteria of the academic job position of 'Chief Assistant Professor'. Their structure and content meet, and even exceed, the indicators of the national criteria and the faculty requirements for occupying the academic position of an 'Associate Professor' (according the requirements of the FESS, Protocol №134/22.04.2019.).

- It has been over fulfilled the minimum requirements of the *ADASRB* (announced at the State Gazette, Issue 56, as of July, 6th, 2018) for occupying the academic position of an 'Associate Professor' in the field 3. *Social, Economic, and Legal Sciences (Annex 6)*.

- It's elaborated a monograph in the field of the announced competition in a total of 146 pages that even exceeds the minimum requirements. It's been reviewed by two famous scientist in the field.

- The scientific papers are in appropriate scientific style. It is also impressive the well-aware professional aptitude of the applicant, her analytical way of thinking and precise synthesizing skills.

- The number of citations proves the scientific appreciation in connection with the contributions of ch. ass. prof. Mina Anglova, PhD.

The analysis of the scientific publications substantiates the assertion that Dr. Angelova's R&D activities are distinguished by their emphasized practical value. She is an expert as in theory, as in the application of appropriate tools for investigation and overcoming important management problems.

4. Evaluation of the Personal Contribution of the Applicant

The applicant in this competitive selection procedure has submitted a declaration of originality and authenticity required by the *Rules of Application of the ADASRB (Annex 8)*.

The content of the scientific papers and the applied documents confirm the conclusion that the above mentioned are an individual contribution of the author.

This serves as a confirmation about the author's declaration connected with the scientific and applied science contributions.

5. Critical Notes and Recommendations

Having focused in particular on the future scientific activities of the applicant in the announced competitive selection procedure, it has to be stated the next recommendations:

- It should be noted that there is a duplication of ideas and partial repetitions in some of the publications suggested for review. This is understandable and acceptable based on the fact that parts of the tools used to solve some management problems can be applied in others. Moreover, some of the research already done in previous periods may be deepened and new results may be achieved in the same and/or other areas.

- In general, the subject of researches of ch. ass. prof. Mina Angelova, PhD is focused over specific management fields (entrepreneurship, entrepreneurial culture, motivation, business processes) and directly connected with them. From my point of view, this is an obstacle to more detailed investigation of other problems that are in a great importance for management improvement and connected with the HRM.

- I recommend more individual scientific publications, for which she already has the necessary qualification, knowledge and experience. In this aspect, the development and printing of textbooks and training aids with case studies in the areas she is familiar with - e.g. management of social services, social entrepreneurship, wine production, mechanical engineering, meat processing industry and more.

- Having in mind both the quality of the scientific papers of the applicant in this competitive selection procedure and the thorough command of English language, it would be appropriate to participate with reports in conferences abroad. This could be a prerequisite for the sake of greater recognition among the international scientific community and membership in world organizations of scientists in the field.

These recommendations do not detract from the contributions of Ch. Assistant Professor Mina Angelova and do not affect the overall positive assessment of her merits.

They should be considered as a milestone consideration for her future scientific work and further investigations.

6. Personal Impressions

I do not know in person the applicant for the tenure-track academic job position of ‘Associate professor’. My impressions are based upon the submitted set of materials in the competitive selection procedure.

CONCLUSION

The documents and materials presented by Chief Assistant Professor Mina Nikolaeva Angelova, PhD **meet all the requirements** of the *Act for the Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria* (ADASRB), the *Rules of Application* of the ADASRB, and the corresponding *Rules* of the University of Plovdiv “Paisii Hilendarski”.

The candidate has submitted **a sufficient number of scientific papers**, published after publishing of the materials, employed for the defence of the Doctoral Degree (PhD) and they are in the professional field of the announced competitive selection procedure.

The applicant's works have original scientific and applied contributions that have received international recognition, as a representative part of them have been published in journals and scientific papers, published by international academic publishers. Theoretical achievements of the candidate have practical applicability; some of them are directly oriented to the educational work.

Dr. Angelova's scientific and teaching qualifications **are undoubtedly professional**.

The achieved educational and R&D results by Chief Assistant Professor Mina Angelova, PhD **fully comply** to the specific requirements of the *Faculty of Economic and Social Sciences*, approved in regards to applying the Rules of the University for the implementation of *ADASRB*.

Having considered the whole set of materials and scientific works of the applicant, submitted in this competitive selection procedure, and having conducted a thorough analysis of their importance along to the scientific and applied contributions contained therein, I reckon that I have sound reasons

to deliver my **Positive Assessment** and I recommend to the Scientific Jury Panel to prepare a Project-Report to the Faculty Council of the Faculty of Economic and Social Sciences to elect Chief Assistant Professor **Mina Nikolaeva Angelova, PhD** for the academic position of an Associate Professor at the University of Plovdiv “Paisii Hilendarski” in professional field 3.7. *Administration and Management*, scientific specialty *Economics and Management* (Human Resources Management).

August, 20th 2019

Signature:

(prof. Tzveta Zafirova, PhD)